

BOOK REVIEWS

Angela Tarango, *Choosing the Jesus Way: American Indian Pentecostals and the Fight for the Indigenous Principle* (Chapel Hill: North Carolina University Press, 2014).

The indigenous principle is an approach used in missions that insists that Christianity should be enculturated into the host culture in order to create self-sustaining and self-supporting churches. Although the principle developed in the nineteenth century in response to colonial and paternalistic practices, the Assemblies of God (AG) adopted it as an important part of its mission strategy. Angela Tarango argues in *Choosing the Jesus Way* that the indigenous principle was used by American Indian Pentecostals to resist the paternalism and ethnocentrism of the white executive leadership of the AG in order to gain respect and eventually some autonomy within the institution. Tarango attempts to reconstruct the history of the AG's missionary endeavour among American Indians based on limited and biased archival resources with an awareness of their hagiographical intentions. She traces the origins of Pentecostal ministry to native peoples in America under the auspices of AG home missions. Initially American natives were the object of white missionary endeavours while their cultures were held in suspicion. Tarango includes the conversion narratives of native Pentecostals from the 1930s to 1960 (based on available archival data) and the approaches to evangelism and church planting when indigenous leadership worked under the auspices of white missionaries. However, the 1950s and 1960s represented a time of response to white criticisms and the resurgence of native religions so that Indian Pentecostals redefined Pentecostal doctrines; particularly the doctrine of healing was redefined to also include social reconciliation. Tarango then examines the contestation for an indigenous, all-Indian Bible College under the visionary leadership of Alta Washburn, a female missionary to American Indian peoples who managed to maintain some autonomy by keeping out of sight of the male, AG executives. The push for an indigenous college forced the AG to acknowledge the importance of the indigenous principle. The college also faced difficulties in gathering the diversity of native cul-

tures under one educational institution. As well, Tarango discusses the establishment of the first indigenous, self-supporting AG church under Navajo evangelist Charlie Lee. Finally, the author focuses on Cherokee evangelist John McPherson as the first American Indian representative of the AG and how in the 1970s native leaders forced the AG to acknowledge indigenous leadership in spreading the gospel. The plight of American Indian Pentecostals was not an easy one and often involved frustration, disappointment and paternal attitudes in the AG. Nevertheless, their sense of calling and commitment to Pentecostal Christianity empowered them to press for a voice among fellow Pentecostals.

Although not the primary focus of her study, the author noted the influence of some early native Pentecostals from Canada. Two of the four native leaders Tarango selects for her study migrated from Canada. Andrew Maracle, a Mohawk of the Six Nations Reserve in Ontario, had a difficult upbringing and found his identity by embracing and defending traditional religion and language. He was converted at an AG mission (no indication was given of where or when). However, his call to missionary work followed a near fatal accident that left him paralyzed from the neck down. Six weeks after the accident, Maracle's cousin and a pastor from Canada named Freez visited Maracle in the hospital and prayed for his healing. Maracle claimed to have been miraculously healed and thereafter attended Zion Bible College and became a missionary. Similarly, Rodger Cree, a Mohawk near Montreal, grew up in an independent Pentecostal home. His mother was converted by French Pentecostal evangelist St. Arneault (a protégé of Aimee Semple McPherson), and his father was converted soon after. Although Cree grew up in a loving Pentecostal home he faced French prejudice against natives. Cree was "born-again" at a New Year's Eve service in Montreal at age 17 and received the baptism of the Spirit eight days later. He attended a French Canadian Bible College where he received a vision of a native women crying in sickness that he interpreted as a call to missions. He began his ministry amid the Cree people of Hudson Bay in northern Canada and later became an itinerant evangelist in Canada and the southeastern United States. Cree defended his culture believing that native languages and practices were cultural rather than religious.

Choosing the Jesus Way hints at transnational links in the origins and development of Pentecostalism in North America in which Canadian Pentecostals had an influence on the home missions and institutional development of the AG. Tarango attempts to rectify the lacuna of research on American Indian Pentecostals, even noting that Canadian research on Pentecostalism among native populations has already been undertaken by scholars such as Bob Burkinshaw and Clinton Westman. In other words, avenues for further research on global Pentecostalism extending beyond the United States are hinted at in this study. In terms of the book's objectives, Tarango produces an excellent history of the lived religion of native peoples who challenge the AG's white paternal and colonial assumptions in which American Indian Pentecostals navigated their Pentecostal calling with their native cultural and religious heritage. Scholars of religion, native Christianity and Pentecostalism will find it a fascinating read.

Peter Althouse
Southeastern University

Lisa P. Stephenson, *Dismantling the Dualisms for American Pentecostal Women in Ministry: A Feminist-Pneumatological Approach*, (Leiden, Netherlands: Brill, 2012).

Lisa Stephenson's *Dismantling the Dualisms* is a revised and expanded version of her Ph.D. dissertation under the supervision of Lyle Dabney at Marquette University. Stephenson demonstrates how drawing out Pentecostalism's pneumatological impulse and then putting it into critical dialogue with current theological perspectives (in this case, Feminism) can constructively contribute to current theological concerns and church ministry practices. The importance of her book is attested by the fact that it was selected by the Society for Pentecostal Studies Editorial Committee to receive the 2013 Pneuma Book Award. This award is given annually to one book that represents a significant achievement in scholarship related to Pentecostal and Charismatic studies. Furthermore, her pneumatological argument of humanity being recreated and transformed into the *imago Spiritus* compliments and strengthens a feminist egalitarian anthropology and ecclesiology. Feminism primarily draws upon *imago Dei* and *imago Christi*. In this way, the work also makes an important pneumatological contribution to Feminist theology.

Stephenson's primary objective is "to provide *Pentecostals* with a sound theological argument for women in ministry" (6). Her goal is not simply to support women in ministry but as the title clearly states, she will dismantle the oppressive sin created by "hierarchal" and "patriarchal" dualisms that operate in explicit and implicit ways in North American Pentecostalism. She offers a constructive pneumatological proposal rooted in Luke-Acts and developed in critical dialogue with Feminism. The introductory chapter provides a clear and concise rationale for the work and an overview of the organizational structure. She also addresses the primary concern of each chapter. The reader is fully informed as what to expect as she progresses through the work. The concluding chapter briefly recapitulates the key concerns of each section and offers helpful suggestions for contextualized implementation of a feminist-pneumatological anthropology and ecclesiology.

The book is broken down into 3 major sections and each section has two chapters. Section one engages in careful historical analysis. Chapter 2 explains the formal ecclesiastical policy and practices of four

classical North American Pentecostal denominations (Church of God, Cleveland, TN which is also her tradition; Church of God in Christ, Assemblies of God and International Church of the Foursquare Gospel) as it relates to women in ministry. Two are officially hierarchal (Church of God and Church of God in Christ) and the other two are more egalitarian. However, the historical development of ecclesiastical polity demonstrates the excruciating difficulty women face because of polity restrictions and practices. Stephenson confirms that Acts 2 affirms women in ministry but cannot thoroughly liberate women from patriarchal subjugation. Chapter 3 is a representative review of contemporary literature concerning Pentecostal women in ministry. She engages in what she calls descriptive accounts driven by sociological and/or historical methodology (Poloma, Roebuck, Blumhofer, Ware, Alexander). She selectively surveys constructive proposals by Pentecostal scholars on women in ministry (Thomas and Everts on hermeneutics, Bridges Johns on theological argument and more lay oriented pastoral proposals by Gill and Cavaness and Gause and Alexander). She supports her argument that pneumatology has not been properly brought into the discussion in a constructive manner. Section one is informative and challenges the myth that Pentecostalism's origins were egalitarian and to some extent that the issue can be resolved without a critical hermeneutic. It also reveals how women have carved out space through officially recognized women's ministry programs (particularly, Church of God in Christ).

Section two addresses the patriarchal dualism via theological anthropology. Chapter 4 examines Lukan pneumatology. Stephenson argues that Pentecostalism's primary text for empowerment for ministry (Acts 2) provides a sound rationale for women to be in ministry. However, such empowerment for ministry has not translated into a full functional and ontological understanding of female and male equality. In chapter 4, she readdresses Spirit baptism. She argues that Spirit baptism is more than an ecclesiastical gift (contra Menzies and Stronstad), but a soteriological experience that calls for a recreation of the ontological ordering of the community through an egalitarian understanding. Drawing on the work of Strauss, Turner and others she argues that Luke builds his pneumatology on an Isaianic exodus theology for the new community of "equals." This is the key chapter to her primary ar-

gument for a pneumatological approach to anthropology and ecclesiology that addresses ontology of being.

Whereas chapter 4 engaged in Lukan biblical theology of Spirit baptism, Chapter 5 is a constructive proposal for a pneumatological anthropology. Here she develops her understanding of the new community (as presented in chapter 4) as being transformed into the *imago Spiritus*. This compliments feminist and egalitarian views based upon creation (*imago Dei*) and christology (*imago Christi*) and results in a Trinitarian informed anthropology. She deconstructs hierarchal dualism and reconstructs a pneumatological feminist egalitarian perspective grounded in Pentecostalism's favored biblical books (Luke-Acts) and identity shaping experience (Spirit baptism).

Section three puts ecclesiology into the spotlight in order to dismantle hierarchal ecclesiology and clericalism. She engages key ecclesiological features of three prominent feminist scholars: from Schüssler Fiorenza the discipleship of equals, from Reuther, the church as a community of liberation reworked under the church as an Isaianic new exodus community from patriarchy, and from Russell, the church as a household of God's freedom. By reimagining Pentecostal ecclesiology through pneumatological and feminist perspectives Stephenson hopes to bring liberation to Pentecostal women and men. Stephenson provides a pneumatological-feminist theological understanding of anthropology and ecclesiology grounded in Pentecostalism's primary identity shaping biblical narrative (Luke-Acts) as a means to support feminist theology and praxis. In doing so she also reveals a subversive stream of Pentecostal spirituality that is concerned with liberation and equality.

This book is a must read for theologians, students, and ministers interested in a substantial critique of Spirit baptism as simply an ecclesiastical function of empowerment, Pentecostal ecclesiastical polity addressing women in ministry, pneumatological (Pentecostal) feminist theology, egalitarian ecclesiology and anthropology, and a pneumatological methodology for theological praxis. I strongly recommend this work as a supplementary text for upper undergrad and graduate courses in Pentecostal and feminist theology.

Kenneth Archer
Southeastern University

Donald E. Miller, Kimon H. Sargeant, and Richard Flory (eds.), *Spirit and Power: The Growth and Global Impact of Pentecostalism* (Oxford University Press, 2013).

Any scholarly work that helps prevent the renewal tradition from becoming too insular is always welcome! This volume edited by Donald E. Miller, Kimon H. Sargeant, and Richard Flory is a publication from outside the tradition, although several of the contributors are writing from within it. In that regard, the work is a delightful mixture of Pentecostal-Charismatic research and perspectives as well as the results of other religious, political, and social projects.

The editors focus on one aspect of Protestant Christianity that increasingly cannot be ignored: namely, the continuing global impact of traditional Pentecostal denominations and also, perhaps even more significantly, the impact of the multifarious indigenous Pentecostals in Africa, Asia, and Latin America. They also include “numerous Christians in Protestant denominations that share many of the characteristics of Pentecostals and ‘renewed’ Catholics”(6).

The reinvention of global Christianity and in some ways even the political and social life of countries in the southern hemisphere as a result of renewal movements is certainly the underlying theme. The findings analyzed in the various essays are drawn heavily from Pew Forum surveys (some included as appendices) and/or the work of various authors at the ground level. The reality is that demographics are being transformed; in some cases Pentecostals run for public office and the movement itself is contributing to democracy by challenging the long-held monopoly of state religions.

The book is divided into seven distinct sections. The first is an introductory one on origins with contributions from Allan H. Anderson and Cecil M. Robeck, Jr., both of whom are excellent representative voices who take different views of the history of the Pentecostal phenomenon, the former arguing for multiple independent origins, the latter agreeing to a point but with the qualification that complex networks developed traceable lines back to Azusa Street. Attempting to answer the question why Pentecostalism is growing, Section Two has an essay by R. Andrew Chestnut that uses the metaphor of marketplace consumer demand to explain the message of Pentecostals as demand for release from poverty and social disfranchisement and another by Henri

Gooren that zeroes in on growth of non-Catholic churches in Paraguay. Section Three features Pentecostalism and politics. Paul Freston describes the social impact and political involvement of Pentecostals in Latin America, noting that its diversity is too great to allow for any national political movement but also that its self-image as the answer to political corruption does not always hold up. Robert D. Woodman examines the relationship between Pentecostalism and democracy outlining the reasons for the lack of research in this area and concluding that it has had a “moderate positive impact” such as economic and educational improvements and expansion of religious liberty.

Section Four addresses social engagement. Timothy H. Wadkins specifically analyzes the experience of El Salvador where Pentecostalism becomes more individualistic with emphasis on personal encounter with the Spirit resulting in the adoption of an empowered lifestyle. Danny McCain looks at case studies in Nigeria where Pentecostalism is emerging from a conservative movement somewhat isolated from society to a flourishing, engaging influence. Section Five centers on transnational Pentecostalism and the so-called “reverse missionary movement.” Afe Adogame argues against the notion of Pentecostalism as a religious movement originates solely in the United States and for the priority of external factors in favor of a reminder of the complexity and diversity within African Christianity. Juan Francisco Martinez concentrates on the transnational Latino ministry in Los Angeles where migrants become “informal missionaries” to their home countries in the same way those who visited Azusa Street took their experiences back home. Section Six deals with the extraordinary place of women in Pentecostalism compared with evangelical mainstream Christian traditions. Estrelida Alexander provides a brief overview of eleven women whose role was central to the formation and expansion of the Pentecostal movement from its inception and argues for a “broader lens” through which to view global Pentecostalism. Katherine Attanasi examines two case studies in South Africa asking whether Pentecostalism is a masculine or feminine ethos and whether the movement is good or bad for women.

In the final Section Seven, William Kay argues that he has observed social and personal spiritual experience of the divine to be at the heart of the various facets of Pentecostalism, both interconnected and powerful. Margaret Poloma and Matthew Lee narrow this down to the dual experiences of prophecy and prophetic prayer, which they see as

connected with an individual believer's interaction with God in the context of love. Two of the editors then round out the work with a concluding chapter reiterating the phenomenological nature of Pentecostalism without the need for ontological argumentation for the reality of the Spirit. The nature of Pentecostalism as centered in the immanence of the divine is what makes for such a dynamic movement.

The work contains an amazing cross-section of some of the most important trajectories in Pentecostal scholarship. In their attempt to be as comprehensive as possible, the editors obviously had to make choices. The reader is quick to notice that they have omitted the growing discipline of pneumatology and science. Yet, the work is a commendable collection of the research and analysis of a diverse group of scholars of religion, history, and sociology. It is very readable making for an excellent introductory text to the global Pentecostal movement. The closing affirmation of the Spirit as dynamic and constantly recreating what becomes routinized and over-institutionalized is inspiring.

Ewen Butler
Regent University

Larry Eskridge, *God's Forever Family: The Jesus People Movement in America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013).

The Jesus People Movement exercised a significant influence on North American evangelical culture, as well as on the broader religious culture, and its effects are still noticeable to this day. It achieved this even though during the glory days of the movement it operated largely on the margins of church and religious culture as befitting its counter-culture ethos. The story of the movement is well told by Larry Eskridge in this account that combines oral history, retrospective analysis and a reasonable, although quite sympathetic, assessment of the movement.

For people like myself who came to maturity within conservative churches in the late 60s and early 70s the Jesus movement introduced something exotic and exciting. As a young teenager I remember hanging out at Immanuel Church in downtown Calgary, which for a couple of years was a vibrant center of the Jesus movement in western Canada. In high school I occasionally spent Saturday evenings at a coffeehouse sponsored by a Baptist church to reach young people in the city center. Although aware of the Jesus movement because of these and other experiences, the movement seemed to me to be not much more than a mere curiosity and a passing fad. The value of this book is that by placing the movement in a larger framework it is able to show not only the importance of the movement in its day but also its enduring impact on the life of the church.

Eskridge stated intentions in writing this history of the movement are to seek to examine the Jesus movement's beginnings, development and effects. To accomplish this he makes use of four major sources of information that up to this point had not received sufficient attention. These are written sources produced by people involved in or close to the movement at the time, contemporary coverage of the movement and assessments of its immediate significance, later interviews with people who were key participants in the movement, and responses to a survey of Jesus movement members conducted in the late 1990s and early 2000s. These sources provide much useful information that Eskridge skillfully weaves together to produce an entertaining and instructive narrative.

According to Eskridge the Jesus People Movement was part of a trend that had begun in the first half of the 20th century and that pro-

duced the Youth for Christ movement during World War Two. This emphasis on youth directed evangelism created a context for the Jesus Movement to receive a certain level of acceptance and encouragement within the wider evangelical church. Moreover, it marked the first time that American evangelical youth received permission to replicate the larger youth culture yet within set moral constrictions directed toward the drug use and sexual expression that characterized late 60s youth culture.

This openness to the broader youth culture led to what is probably the most enduring contribution of the Jesus movement, namely the rise of a more informal worship culture within the church and in particular the significant impact of praise and worship music that aspired at creating a meaningful corporate worship experience. The book provides a useful history of the role of music both within the Jesus People movement and in subsequent years as its musical style influenced the development of the Contemporary Christian Music industry.

The book gives some attention to the theological character of the movement but more careful analysis of this important matter would have been helpful. Eskridge draws attention to the movement's biblicism and literalist interpretations, its preoccupation with Bible prophecy and a pessimistic eschatology, and its emphasis on Pentecostal and charismatic phenomena but he does not discuss the effect of this combination of beliefs and practices on the overall impact of the movement. In part these theological characteristics, especially the eschatological focus, demonstrate that the Jesus People movement was a creature of its time and as much influenced by as influencing the conservative evangelical church. It is fair to say that the Jesus movement had a much greater impact on the church than on the larger society. To what extent this is due to the eschatological pessimism that permeated the movement is a question worth considering. It is significant that movements that are broadly Pentecostal and charismatic and yet at the same time are distinguished by a pessimistic eschatology tend not to have as great an impact on the larger society as do Pentecostal and charismatic movements that are characterized by a kingdom of God eschatology. More reflection on the theological influences on the movement and the extent to which these supported or unduly limited the effectiveness of the movement is needed. Yet this does not significantly detract from what it is as very en-

gaging and informative history of this important movement that definitively shaped the contemporary church.

Blaine Charette
Northwest University

Steven M. Studebaker, *From Pentecost to the Triune God: A Pentecostal Trinitarian Theology*. Pentecostal Manifestos Series. (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2012).

Recent theological scholarship has seen a significant resurgence in both pneumatology and Trinitarian theology. But what does pneumatology, particularly Pentecostal pneumatology, have to offer to Trinitarian theology? This question is at the heart of Steven Studebaker's book. Studebaker argues that the Pentecostal experience of the Spirit, which corresponds to the biblical narratives of the Spirit, lays the foundation for a Pentecostal contribution to Trinitarian theology. Thus, the book moves from experience (chapter one) and Scripture (chapter two) to interaction with tradition (chapters three to five); in other words, *From Pentecost to the Triune God*. Throughout the book, Studebaker works from the principle that "God's activity in the economy of redemption is the basis of theological reflection" (4). The last two chapters give examples of how this Pentecostal Trinitarian theology engages Christian belief and practice in today's world.

In chapter one, Studebaker argues that the "inseparable relationship" between religious experience and theology leads to the theological hermeneutical principle that the experience of the Spirit informs the theological task (1, 35). The Pentecostal experience of Spirit baptism—in all its meanings and interpretations—is "a legitimate and fertile source of theology in general and Trinitarian theology in particular" (12). Chapter two explains how this experience of the Spirit can provide the hermeneutical lens for understanding Scripture and the biblical narratives of the Spirit. It is specifically the Spirit of Pentecost that provides the "navigating point" and orienting source to the biblical narratives of the Spirit and for a Pentecostal contribution to Trinitarian theology (12, 46). The key argument is that the economic work of the Spirit of Pentecost—explained by Studebaker as liminal, constitutional, and consummative—most fully reveals the Spirit's immanent identity: "the Spirit of Pentecost culminates the work of redemption (economic Trinity) and therefore brings the triune life of the Godhead to fulfillment (immanent Trinity)" (98).

Whereas chapters one and two lay the foundational theological hermeneutic and set forth the fundamental content of a Pentecostal Trinitarian theology, chapters three through five bring those insights

into ecumenical conversation with key figures in Eastern, Western, evangelical, and charismatic Trinitarian theology. The pneumatological work done in the first one hundred pages comes to life as Studebaker seeks “to overcome the implicit subordination of the Spirit to Christ in traditional Trinitarian theologies” and “to make a Pentecostal contribution to traditional Trinitarianism” (166). Studebaker shows how a Pentecostal approach distinguishes itself from and contributes to other approaches in Trinitarian theology and the debates surrounding it involving processions, *filioque*, hypostasis, appropriations, social Trinitarianism, the mutual-love model, and more. These traditions often overlook or marginalize the role of the Holy Spirit and the economic role of the Trinity found in the biblical narrative, which serves as a guide to the Spirit’s immanent identity (186). Thus, Studebaker seeks to supplement these Christocentric theologies by highlighting the consummational and constitutional role the Spirit has in the fellowship of the triune God and the reciprocal relationship between the Holy Spirit and Jesus Christ (9, 97; cf. 233). He is not advising a move from christocentrism to pneumacentrism—an accusation he repeatedly defends himself against (see 7, 96, 136, 146, 166). Rather, the Pentecostal Trinitarian theology Studebaker proposes emphasizes that the divine person’s identities are mutually contingent on the others (146).

The theological work of the first five chapters bears significant fruit in the final two as Studebaker gives examples of how “theology should engage the real world” (242), specifically, how pneumatology and Trinitarian theology can change our thinking and behavior with regard to theology of religions and creation care. Both chapters are creative, provocative, and controversial. Studebaker believes that the universal work of the Spirit of Pentecost and the “pneumatological instincts” of Pentecostal theology might lead us to see how the Spirit is at work in the religions and how the religions may even provide potential avenues to experience and participate in the work of the Spirit (222). Similarly, a Trinitarian basis for a pneumatological theology of creation will allow one to see creation care as inseparable from the work of redemption and as a vital part of Christian discipleship and participation in the Spirit of Pentecost (244, 261; cf. 68). Therefore, buying organic fair-trade coffee may be equally important as attending church and protesting energy-inefficient office buildings is equivalent to fighting gambling venues (262, 267).

Studebaker produces an important contribution to the *Pentecostal Manifestos* series; it joins in the ongoing task of developing the emerging Pentecostal theological tradition and offers some “first steps” toward a Pentecostal Trinitarian theology (207). His Pentecostal perceptivity combined with his Trinitarian theological acuity make him a solid candidate to be a Pentecostal voice in the ecumenical conversation on the doctrine of the Trinity. It is not surprising Studebaker’s work earned him the honor of the Society for Pentecostal Studies 2014 *PNEUMA* book award. For Pentecostals, Studebaker has provided a thorough exploration of an overlooked subject in Pentecostal pneumatology while also laying out an imitable pattern and method for how Pentecostal theology can bring insight into important theological issues. His emphasis on the reciprocal relationship between theology and experience is especially helpful as Pentecostals continue to wrestle with the theological significance of their experience of the Spirit. In addition, Trinitarian theologians from all traditions will be challenged by Studebaker’s appeal to reconsider the passive and often ambiguous role assigned to the Spirit in the Trinity, which betrays the prominent role given to the Spirit of Pentecost in the biblical story of redemption.

Joseph Dutko
Vancouver, BC

Kate Bowler, *Blessed: A History of the American Prosperity Gospel* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014).

“Beloved, I wish above all things that thou mayest prosper and be in health even as thy soul prosperth.” (3 John 2)

Attempts to define the American prosperity gospel are legion. The movement is a complex cultural religion followed by millions of Americans. Suave Leaders exhibit shared values and strategies via networks of preachers, churches, schools, conferences, television and radio networks, associations, and publications that circulate their message. In an attempt to capture the essence of the movement, Kate Bowler, assistant professor of American Religion at Duke Divinity School, produces a thorough research project first submitted as a dissertation under Grant Wacker.¹ After eight years of research including visits to 25 percent of America's prosperity megachurches, annual major conferences, phone interviews, archival visits, and 18 months as an observer and worshiper at Victorious Faith Center, an 80-member African-American prosperity church in Durham, North Carolina, she settles on four dominant themes/words that shape the nomenclature of the movement, namely faith, health, wealth, and victory.

For Bowler, faith functions as the first and primary emphasis for the initial wave of the prosperity gospel to emerge out of post-WW2 Pentecostalism. As Pentecostal preachers withdrew from their denominations, they formed independent ministries and took advantage of the postwar economic boom. As indoor plumbing, telephones, stoves and refrigerators, televisions, and automobiles became common “luxuries,” prosperity preachers capitalized on the new day as a divine reversal of fortune (53). Such faith means more than saving faith, but manifestation of God's blessings via “positive confession” of three subsequent themes.

Healing, a cardinal doctrine of Pentecostalism, serves as the most obvious manifestation of active faith. Multiple forms evolve: healing in the atonement; secrets of prayer and fasting; the use of handkerchiefs, cloths, and oils; exorcism/deliverance from evil; and medicinal

¹ The first substantial work on the American prosperity gospel since David Edwin Harrell's *All Things are Possible: The Healing & Charismatic Revivals in Modern America* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1975).

practices (all of them marketed upon “biblical principles”). While some rail against medicine as a threat to or lack of faith, Oral Roberts’ visionary (yet short-lived) City of Faith in Tulsa was the first to marry a clinic-hospital-research facility and address spiritual and physical ailments by way of Spirit-filled doctors.

Similarly, wealth may be demonstrated in a multitude of ways. Exegesis of a Roberts’ adage such as “Giving is not a debt you owe; it’s a seed you sow” displays to the public that financial abundance of the believer is built upon spiritual principles of “first fruits.” To do so, leaders turn to an array of Scriptures for proof (texts): the hundredfold return (Mark 10:29-31), giving and getting (Luke 6:38), tithing (Malachi 3:10-11), God’s abundant provision (Philippians 4:19), declarations of “dominion over Satan,” “words of life not death” (Proverbs 18:21), or reciprocal gifts of “gold, frankincense, and myrrh” (Matthew 2:11). Bowler demonstrates well that socio-economic context typically drives application, whether the 1980s heyday of Jimmy Bakker’s middle class Heritage USA (America’s third most visited attraction and a combination of a plush resort and Six Flags) or the recent success of positive psychology by Joel Osteen [“If every day, I declare that ‘I am blessed. I am prosperous... God will do his part’ (125-6)].

Finally, insiders must manifest victory. Since “God didn’t create any of us to be average,” one must move beyond “unsaved and merely saved” to a life of triumph. Bowler demonstrates again the array of pragmatic methods and applications including prayer techniques (Matthew 18:19); strength and safety (often angels and territorial mapping); and conferences to fix marriages, reverse financial woes, and heal damaged emotions. In a fascinating twist, Bowler notes the irony of the often acute disdain for the iconography of historic churches; instead, prosperity churches proffer their own emphases - preachers with Rhema Bible or Oral Roberts University training and triumphant symbolism through globes, flags, and soaring eagles.

Bowler whets the appetite for so much more! First, since the prosperity gospel functions within the larger framework of American religion, those who embrace or decry its message must consider further the “good life” motif central not only to Christian America, but the American story. Such convergence certainly warrants further theological, economic, and political attention. Not immune to failure and scandal (e.g., Swaggart, Bakker, Schuller), what is it about the tenacity of its

(new) leaders that generates ongoing reinvention? What are the early signals concerning its future in light of the current/post economic crisis? What about the increasingly complex role of Zionism (e.g., Hinn, Hagee, Parsley) on the religio-political landscape or Bowler's veiled recommendation to measure the income levels of American prosperity believers?

Bowler hits on major threads of the prosperity message that warrant specific studies. In the spirit of T.D. Jakes bestseller *Woman, Thou Art Loosed*, and the complexities of Bowler's four interlocking themes, how do proponents negotiate the roles of women in the home, marketplace, or ministry?² What about the role of the prosperity gospel as a primary impulse of Christianity in the global south? Though countless American prosperity messengers have gone global via international crusades, training schools, literature, and media (whether radio, television, or social media), what is the nomenclature of homegrown prosperity stations such as Yoido Full Gospel Church (South Korea), El Shaddai (Philippines), City Harvest Church (Singapore), Hillsong Church (Australia), or the Universal Church of the Kingdom of God (Brazil)? How are these ever-increasing global incarnations now shaping the American religious landscape (e.g., the Nigerian-based Redeemed Christian Church of God has some 400 churches across the country)?

Finally, while Canadian readers should note Bowler's roots from Winnipeg and consult her earlier work, "From Far and Wide: The Canadian Faith Movement" in *Church & Faith Trends* (February 2010),³ is it not time, perhaps for another young Canadian scholar, to produce a full-length investigation not only of the impact of American prosperity preachers on the Canadian scene, but also a study of our own homegrown proponents? This work (with 60 pages of footnotes and bibliography) will remain an important resource for years to come.

Martin W. Mittelstadt
Evangel University

² There is no shortage of women in the movement from Maria Woodworth-Etter, Aimee Semple McPherson, Kathryn Kuhlman, Freda Lindsay, Daisy Osborn, and Marilyn Hickey to Gloria Copeland, Paula White, and Joyce Meyers.

³ http://files.efccanada.net/min/rc/cft/V03I01/Canadian_Faith_Movement.pdf. Accessed May 27, 2014.

Michael Wilkinson (ed.), *Global Pentecostal Movements: Migration, Mission, and Public Religion* (Brill: Leiden, 2012).

With ten essays prefaced by an introduction from Michael Wilkinson, this collection documents and evaluates current developments among Pentecostals across the globe, offering valuable research and analysis for those evaluating contemporary Pentecostalism. Professor of Sociology and Director of the Religion in Canada Institute at Trinity Western University, Wilkinson makes the move from documenting Pentecostal movements in Canada in monographs [*The Spirit Said God* (2006), *Canadian Pentecostalism* (2009)] and edited compilations [*A Liberating Spirit* and *Winds from the North* (both 2010)] to a wider set of studies in global Pentecostalism in this volume. Recently elected as a future President of the Society for Pentecostal Studies and Chair of the Program Committee for its 2015 Annual Meeting, he is emerging a significant figure in contemporary Pentecostal studies, with this text making a notable contribution to the field.

This volume stands in continuity with other recent sociological and anthropological work on the varieties of Pentecostal and renewal movements. Three of the volume's contributors are connected with the Centre for Pentecostal and Charismatic Studies at the University of Birmingham (UK). There are Wilkinson's own connections with Peter Beyer of the University of Ottawa and his work on religion and globalization. Then there is a certain corpus of works lingering in the background as influences on this collection, including the work of the influential sociologist of religion David Martin, the globalized Pentecostal theology of Amos Yong, and the "progressive Pentecostalism" documented by Donald E. Miller and Tetsunao Yamamori in their *Global Pentecostalism: The New Face of Christian Social Engagement* (2007).

Wilkinson starts the volume by employing the "many tongues" metaphor prevalent in Pentecostal theology and scholarship as an explanatory sign of the diversity of global Pentecostalism. This diversity is apparent in three emphases found in this text as it accounts for migration among Pentecostals, the many trajectories of Pentecostal mission work, and Pentecostal engagements in public religion – thus the subtitle of the text.

Following Wilkinson's introduction, the book is structured in three sections: "Negotiation," "Expansion," and "Contextualization." The chapters then offer a variety of modes of sociological scholarship in order to deal with particular Pentecostal movements. Each chapter helpfully frames the context and scope of its area of research in its opening pages, providing necessary information to those without expertise in that area as well as clarity about the author's presuppositions.

"Negotiation" begins with Richard Burgess' synthesizing evaluation of Pentecostal political culture in Sub-Saharan Africa. Burgess briefs readers on the role of Pentecostals in the politics of Nigeria, Zambia and Kenya as his evaluation especially focuses on the record of Pentecostalism in relation to the establishment of democratic structures and practices. In the second chapter, A. Christian Van Gorder's account of Christian-Muslim conflict in Nigeria provides a challenge to oversimplified narratives of a complex situation. Girish Daswani's chapter on Pentecostal networks in Ghana addresses Ghanaian Pentecostal theologies of culture both in Ghana and among Ghanaian immigrants to the United Kingdom.

"Expansion" provides documentation of three quite different stories of Pentecostal missionary efforts. David Reed explores the successful missionary work in Indonesia of an independent Pentecostal church, Bethel Temple (Seattle, WA), and the subsequent growth of Gereja Bethel Indonesia (GBI). Reed carefully follows the theology of the "Name of God" developed by Bethel's pastor William Offiler (1875-1957) as it has been subsequently adopted by the Indonesian GBI. Reed also offers some intriguing observations about the way modernity has influenced Indonesian Pentecostalism.

Connie Au and Seth Zielicke each document difficult cases in Pentecostal missionary work. Au follows the personal writings of the Pentecostal Holiness Church missionary William H. Turner in the midst of the heightened years of the Anti-Christian movement in China (1924-1928). The chapter provides helpful background for understanding the growth of indigenous Chinese Christian movements over the past century. Zielicke takes up the morally ambiguous case of the wildly successful revivals held by the American missionary Tommy Hicks in Argentina in the early 1950s. This chapter collects some available testimony about the revivals, which raise questions about the authenticity of Hicks' ministry and the political elements involved in this revival.

“Contextualization” examines the development of Pentecostal movements in particular settings. Joseph Bosco Bangura enters the fray of naming and differentiating movements among global Pentecostals. He identifies New Indigenous Churches (NICs) as post-1970s movements, mostly found in West Africa, which operate from a certain set of principles that include a high regard for Scripture, especially texts concerning prosperity, healing and victory; are critical of traditional African spiritual traditions; and are politically interventionist. He differentiates them from the African Indigenous Churches (AICs), which were founded in anti-colonial contexts.

In the second chapter of the final section, Thomas Aehtner studies an African immigrant church in Calgary, Alberta. His acknowledgment of the function of the prosperity gospel and the power of the Spirit documents spiritual-theological rationale among the church members along with sociological explanations. The third chapter, from Otto Maduro, contextualizes and then documents the stories of five Latina women pastors in Newark, NJ. They are stories of overcoming difficulties in “God-centered” lives. Finally, Nestor Medina provides a short essay evaluating the history of immigration, multiculturalism and racism among Canadian Latinos/as in Canada, questioning the triumphal narrative of Canadian multiculturalism.

The overall collection is valuable, even if the studies seem to run into limitations in their research. More than anything, such a combination of value and limitation exemplifies the limited funding available for research in Pentecostal studies. Despite some strides in this direction, the growth in global Pentecostalism has not been met by proportionate support for primary research. Universities and foundations for the study of religion need to offer Wilkinson and his guild more support in their endeavors. Nevertheless, this collection provides fodder for rethinking important concepts used to account for Pentecostal movements and the cultures of which they are a part. This text should be added to any library that studies contemporary Pentecostalism as it will serve as a resource to university students at all levels. It is also recommended for those attempting to stay abreast of the manifold developments of global Pentecostalism.

L. William Oliverio,
Marquette University

Wolfgang Vondey and Martin W. Mittelstadt (Editors), *The Theology of Amos Yong and the New Face of Pentecostal Scholarship: Passion for the Spirit* (Leiden: Brill, 2013).

Amos Yong may be the most influential Pentecostal theologian alive today. If he's not foremost, he's at least one of the top five. Part of the reason Yong has been so influential is that he has been so prolific. Although only a middle-aged man (50?), he has published more than 20 books, many of them monographs. He's written more than 100 articles and essays, publishing them in a wide array of journals.

Yong is also influential because he's interested in so many subjects. He explores and publishes on science, biblical interpretation, ecumenical and interreligious dialogues (especially Buddhism), disability, systematic theology, love, philosophy, missiology, Evangelicalism, and, of course, pneumatology. In his work on these subjects and many more, Yong expands understanding of what it means to do a theology of the Spirit.

A new collection of essays, *The Theology of Amos Yong and the New Face of Pentecostal Scholarship: Passion for the Spirit*, explores many facets of Yong's work. The book's editors, Wolfgang Vondey and Martin William Mittelstadt, rightly say, "few other figures stand out with more clarity than Amos Yong" (1). The introduction describes how Yong's leadership and publishing have been widely influential. His writing is often the first exposure many have to Pentecostal scholarship. Yong represents a generation of scholars who together formulate a new rationale for the vitality and future of Pentecostal scholarship, say the editors. This scholarship overcomes many tensions between Pentecostal spirituality and science, for instance.

The introduction to the edited collection not only speaks of Yong's contributions. It also offers a history of the overall rationale of Pentecostal scholarship today. I found this aspect of the book especially helpful. Essays in the book are carefully ordered. They begin by exploring Yong's work in light of biblical, hermeneutical and theological discussions. Thereafter, essayists look at various contemporary conversations, such as the issues of theology and disability, contemporary culture and film, wider world religions, Trinitarian discussions, and more.

In addition to asking Pentecostal scholars to explore the fruitfulness of Yong's theological research, editors invited outsiders to the Pentecostal tradition to reflect on Yong's work. Evangelical, Eastern orthodox, Anglican, and Roman Catholic perspectives were provided. This demonstrates not only wisdom on the editors' part, but it also what represents the spirit of Yong's own efforts to engage ecumenical families both within the Christian tradition and outside it. Yong's circle of conversation partners is immense!

Although the breadth of the book's topics is wide, not all topics I would have liked to see addressed were included. For instance, Yong's work on issues of love, systematic theology, and political theology were not represented well in the essays. His worldwide reach is also not well represented among contributors, but to do so would require a much larger book.

I found all essays in this book strong. Rather than reflecting on each, I will comment on two that particularly interested me. Wolfgang Vondey explores Yong's work in the science and religion dialogue. Yong's work in this discussion emerges out of his concern to engage modern and postmodern habits of life shaped by science and technology. Yong also believes credibility of Christian theology today requires engagement with a scientific worldview. And he believes the Pentecostal methodology that emphasizes experience is a natural bridge to the empirical sciences.

In Yong's work, we discover that Pentecostal hermeneutics, with its emphasis upon pneumatology, offers flexible ways to speak about God's work in the world of science. Vondey shows that a Pentecostal hermeneutic provides a way of thinking about creation that complements scientific explanations without undermining them.

Yong's use of C. S. Peirce's philosophy has been helpful as a framework for his science and theology research. Peirce's metaphysical project offers openness to both science and a defense against scientism. As Yong sees it, Peircian metaphysics allows for a teleological view of the laws of nature, including an emphasis upon indeterminacy, spontaneity, and chance. This approach to the natural world fits well with Pentecostal theology, in which the Spirit is active throughout and empowering creatures to move in the presence of God. The creation theology Yong offers suggests we live in a Spirit-filled cosmos. This cosmos includes divine, human, and other spiritual realities. Yong's work to

distinguish the capacities and nature of these realities provides a responsible Pentecostal framework for discussion of science and religion issues.

Mark Mann wrote the other chapter that I found particularly compelling. Mann wonders how Yong fits in the Evangelical world. He concludes that Yong is an evangelical of the reformist variety. For instance, Yong's response to postmodernity has challenged the epistemic foundationalism typical of modernity and modern Evangelicalism. Mann sees Yong's work as having affinity with post-liberal theology. Here again, C.S. Peirce's metaphysics is noted as helpful and influential for understanding Yong's work.

Mann also addresses Yong's pneumatological turn. As a Pentecostal, Yong emphasizes the Holy Spirit's work in the church and the world. This allows him to converse not only with others in the Christian tradition but those outside it. Mann concludes by arguing that in Yong's theology, "we find a call to and method for fidelity to the triune God whose Holy Spirit speaks in many tongues and who blows, like the wind, wherever it will" (220). If Evangelicalism is to have a future, argues Mann, people like Amos Yong must chart its course forward.

One of the nice features of this book is the epilogue provided by the editors. In it, they acknowledge that the relationship between scholarship and the general Pentecostal movement is complex and sometimes difficult. One finds pockets of intellectual sophistication as well as strong anti-intellectualism within Pentecostalism.

Amos Yong represents one who both affirms Pentecostal piety and the full intellectualization of the Pentecostal movement. To date, his influence has been felt most deeply in academia. From Yong's perspective, say the editors, Pentecostal scholarship "cannot afford to disengage from any scholarly conversation without running the risk to appear lifeless, disinterested, secluded, and irrelevant" (271).

Essays in this book make it clear that Yong's influence is deep. And yet as impressive as Yong's work has been to date, it may be that even greater things are still to come. As Yong begins what will be the second half of his career, I anticipate great things from a Pentecostal theologian whose influence has already been great.

Thomas Jay Oord
Pacific Northwest University

Joshua R. Ziefle, *David du Plessis and the Assemblies of God: The Struggle for the Soul of a Movement* (Leiden: Brill, 2013).

“The Pentecostal Movement has never been developed or propagated from one center, unless that center is heaven.” David du Plessis¹

By any measure, David du Plessis exists as a key figure in Twentieth-Century Christianity for his role in three of the era’s major movements. He connected the Pentecostal, Charismatic, and Ecumenical Movements. In this work, Joshua R. Ziefle, Associate Professor at Northwest University in Kirkland, WA, examines the tumultuous relationship between du Plessis and the Assemblies of God (AG). Based upon his 2011 Ph.D. dissertation at Princeton Theological Seminary, Zeifle argues that the friction between du Plessis and the AG grew out of two differing visions of Pentecost. Utilizing Grant Wacker’s categories of the primitive and the pragmatic,² Zeifle suggests that du Plessis and his openness to working outside the established bounds of Pentecostal denominations represents the more primitive vision of Pentecost, while the AG and its emphasis on the need for structure and control exemplifies the pragmatic end of the Pentecostal spectrum.

Zeifle begins by surveying the genesis of the AG and some of the early controversies that defined its character. Debates over the “Finished Work” doctrine of sanctification, tongues as initial evidence of Spirit baptism, and baptism in the name of Jesus only led the AG leadership to issue resolute statements defining “biblical positions.” The AG response to these controversies along with the additional structure that such responses required set the precedent for how the AG dealt with future issues, including du Plessis and his ecumenism.

After the formation of the AG, Zeifle devotes his attention to du Plessis’s biography. Following du Plessis’s 1905 birth in South Africa, his parents converted to Pentecostalism in 1914. After his own conversion, du Plessis served as an open air preacher and received ordination in the Apostolic Faith Mission. Du Plessis accepted a position as the

¹ David du Plessis, *The Spirit Bade Me Go: The Astounding Move of God in the Denominational Churches* (Gainesville, FL: Bridge-Logos, 2004), 5.

² Grant Wacker, *Heaven Below: Early Pentecostals and American Culture* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2001).

denomination's General Secretary in 1936, but he resigned in 1947 and relocated to the United States. While ministering as an ordained pastor in the AG, du Plessis began his encounters with the ecumenical movement by connecting with the World Council of Churches, the National Council of Churches, the International Missionary Council, Full Gospel Business Men's Fellowship, and Princeton Seminary. Through his involvement with these organizations, du Plessis called on those experiencing the Holy Spirit's empowering to remain in their home denominations and seek renewal, rather than "coming out" from among them to join established Pentecostal denominations.

Du Plessis's increased participation in the ecumenical movement led to scrutiny from AG leadership. In a series of page-turning correspondences between du Plessis, the AG, and other notable Pentecostal and non-Pentecostal ecclesial personalities, Zeifle traces how AG officials became increasingly concerned that du Plessis's actions would lead to compromise with the mainline denominations. Citing complaints that he "is an advocate for the Ecumenical Movement" (87), the AG revoked du Plessis' ministerial credentials in 1962.

Zeifle challenges the proposal made by other historians that du Plessis's dismissal stemmed primarily from the AG's relationship with the National Association of Evangelicals (NAE) and the AG leadership's desire to remain in the NAE's good graces. Instead, Zeifle argues that du Plessis's disfellowshipping makes sense in light of the AG's history of opting for control and order. Just as in the early controversies surrounding sanctification, tongues, and the Trinity and the more recent issues of the New Order of the Latter Rain and the 1950s Salvation-Healing Revival, AG leadership felt the need to take definitive action to control its core doctrines and praxis.

Ironically, du Plessis's discharge from the AG provided a boost to his ministry. As various streams of revival emerged in the 1960s and 1970s, du Plessis found himself at the center of renewal movements in numerous Protestant denominations and the Roman Catholic Church. Du Plessis functioned as an interpreter and advisor as he nurtured the Charismatic Movement. Zieffe submits that du Plessis was motivated by the primitive Pentecostal impulse to share the Spirit's message to whoever would listen.

Eventually, the AG would reach conciliation with the Charismatic Movement. Zeifle shows that, in contrast to du Plessis who en-

gaged with Charismatics by going to them, the AG necessitated acceptance on its own terms. Through resolutions and committee reports, the AG developed criteria to identify “true” partakers of the Spirit’s work. While du Plessis fully accepted the Charismatics from the start, the AG moved with a cautious approach driven by a pragmatic concern for control and order. The AG’s gradual, if managed, acceptance of the Charismatic Movement culminated in the restoration of du Plessis’s credentials in 1980.

Several audiences will benefit from Ziefle’s work. Ecumenists will find in du Plessis an example of one who persevered despite pressure from his denomination. Historians of twentieth-century ecclesiastical history will discover a story that impacts the era’s major movements and almost every denomination. Sociologists will uncover a case study in the AG’s development from a cooperative fellowship for the burgeoning Pentecostal movement to the institutionalized guardian of denominational distinctives. Finally, Pentecostals will receive an invitation to ponder afresh the meaning of Pentecost as reflected in the primitive du Plessis and the pragmatic AG.

Overall, Zeifle provides an excellent contribution to help readers understand both du Plessis and the AG. Despite some minor spelling and grammatical errors, he keeps his audience captivated by the events, personalities, and controversies through his engaging writing style, an uncommon characteristic of adapted dissertations. As Pentecostal-like movements grow around the world, Zeifle’s portrayal of du Plessis provides a clarion call for Pentecostal denominations to leave behind their trepidations and to pursue Pentecost wherever it might lead.

Matthew Paugh

St. Paul’s United Methodist Church, Kitzmiller, MD

Peter D. Neumann, *Pentecostal Experience: An Ecumenical Encounter* (Eugene, OR: Pickwick, 2012).

Peter D. Neumann (PhD, University of St. Michael's College) is Assistant Academic Dean at Master's College and Seminary in Toronto. His classroom teaching tends to focus on systematic theology and philosophy. This text furthers this passion. He produces a systematic theological and ecumenical treatment of the heart of Pentecostalism as marked by spiritual or religious experience. This combination is a considerable accomplishment and warrants a close reading for Pentecostal scholars and students.

Neumann candidly admits his desire to develop a nuanced view of experiencing God that is capable of more clearly affirming the mediated nature of spiritual experience. Accordingly, he probes possibilities for Pentecostals' growth in self-understanding and interaction with the broader Christian community. He effectively employs two closely aligned facets. First, religious or spiritual experience has ubiquitous appeal, appeal beyond denominational or sectarian borders, and second, Pentecostalism is a uniquely experiential tradition. The increasing maturation of Pentecostalism as a movement calls for explication of this core element of its own identity in conversation with others.

While Neumann draws deeply from the wells of a wide range of Pentecostal scholars, he relies heavily on the work of three major Pentecostal theologians, Frank Macchia, Simon Chan, and Amos Yong, as conversation partners with the broader Christian tradition, specifically Roman Catholic, Orthodox, and Protestant. Pentecostal theology both informs and is informed by these faith communities. Therefore, Pentecostals may be both encouraged (they have something valuable to offer) and humbled (others have valuable offerings too). Yet here come question marks. Neumann selects Macchia, Chan, and Yong as paradigmatic exemplifications of his hypothesis that maturing Pentecostal theology illuminates the mediated nature of experience. However, I find it odd that he then argues that Pentecostal theology is maturing because they explicate the mediated nature of experience. Is there some circular reasoning going on here? Admittedly, Neumann identifies them as "case studies." Are there notable exceptions among Pentecostals to the pre-selected views of Macchia, Chan, and Yong? May it be that Pentecostal theology does not line up as immature by advance definition? Are there

other options? My questions are not meant to disagree with Neumann's insightful analysis; rather, I simply desire further investigation that includes (or excludes) contrary conclusions.

Neumann's study provides rich reading. He zeroes in on the authoritative role of experience for constructing theology. This requires wrestling with the meaning and significance of appeals to the authority of Scripture, tradition, and reason. Neumann overviews first human encounter of God across Christian theology in the aforementioned Christian traditions before analysis of the Pentecostal tradition. Experience is a ubiquitous but ambiguous concept and term that has moved from a former place of privilege to a current place of suspicion in theological discourse. Given Neumann's emphasis on experience as mediated through linguistic, cultural, and historic contexts, it becomes apparent that appeals to experience in constructing theology must be conducted carefully and cautiously.

Yet Pentecostals appeal unashamedly to experience. I frequently hear Pentecostals say something like "someone with an experience is never at the mercy of someone with an argument" or "better caught than taught." Neumann mentions other adages such as "better felt than telt, better walked than talked." He skillfully traverses such terrain by viewing experience of God as testimony to an encounter. Such encounters can signify authentic experience without controlling or containing transcendent divine content. Thus experience of God becomes a kind of "mediated immediacy." In my opinion, this is a significant move with major potential for articulating Pentecostal understandings of spiritual experience.

The Holy Spirit is the one through whom God is understood to be experienced or encountered. Neumann's acquiescence that in spite of his consistent insistence on greater awareness of the mediated nature of experiencing God as a mark of maturation, Pentecostals must preserve their strong sense of divine immediacy. Pentecostals continue to believe they are directly encountering God through the Holy Spirit. For Neumann, a chief challenge for constructive Pentecostal theology requires further development of a qualified appreciation for the diverse ways in which experience of God is mediated with that retains a continuing affirmation of immediate or direct experiential encounter with God as an authentic reality. I heartily agree.

At its heart Neumann's *Pentecostal Experience* is a consistent correlation of mediated experience as exemplifying Pentecostal maturation with ecumenical investigation of appeals to authority through the emphases of Macchia upon Scripture, Chan on tradition, and Yong on reason. Though Neumann may be accused of oversimplification and undeveloped attention to obvious overlap, his conclusions are not altogether arbitrary. He provides a helpful heuristic device for digging deeper into appeals to spiritual experience for practitioners of Pentecostal theology. He opens up avenues for fruitful engagement with others.

Somewhat surprisingly, Neumann concludes this work with a suggestive analysis of the future of Pentecostal theology at the popular level. At the least, the future promises to be an exciting adventure! Peter Neumann's *Pentecostal Experience: An Ecumenical Encounter* is a significant contribution—an admirable example of the maturation of Pentecostal theology. He demonstrates conclusively that appeals to the experience of God in theology cannot be casually dismissed but neither may they be carelessly developed.

Tony Richie
Pentecostal Theological Seminary